
Waterfront Special Development District Commission

s

Design Review Committee

Minutes of August 31, 2005
Public Hearing

Present: Members: Chairman Jay Gregory, John Pesce, Steven Coutu, John Lynch, and Jeanne Boyle.

Chairman Gregory noted that Monarch would go first on the agenda tonight.

1. Monarch Industries – 10 New Road, Application for Wood Burning Stove.

Mr. Feldstein, attorney for Monarch Industries expressed his thanks to the applicants at Tockwotton for permitting Monarch to go first on the agenda tonight. He said he is with the firm of Roberts, Carroll, Feldstein and Pierce in Providence, RI. Representatives from Monarch Industries are Michael Friedman, President, Steve Kruppa, Charlie Carey of Bio Mass Combustion Systems who will be installing the project and who is the expert and will address the Committee's questions regarding the emissions that came up at the last meeting.

Mr. Charlie Carey explained the process as to how the wood would be burned and where the flu gases will go through the fire boxes. It is a large industrial wood stove which was designed in the early 1980's. He noted that wood can be burned an awful lot cleaner than it is being done in the residential sector. Industrial wood energy is the largest renewal energy resource being used in this country. At this time, he showed the Committee the project layout. The plant currently is using a dust collection system to process its waste along with a grinder which will all be blown into a silo. It is used in the farm industry and in the lumbering industry. The fuel will augered in the back of the fire box. The flu gases go up the stack and air cools the system which becomes the domestic hot air which heats the facility. The system operates at high temperatures which are necessary for complete combustion.

Mr. Carey said the beauty of the system is that it is auger fed and we monitor the amount of fuel going in. It is continuously fed and we can count the rotations of these augers so that we know exactly how much wood is being put in and the BTU's that are being produced. With wood the heat is spread out much more so that the air blowing around the firebox is much more capable of keeping it cool then if you have a smaller concentrated fire. He said as long as you keep the firebox hot there will be nothing coming out of the stack and there will be no odors. He states he derated the burner to 100 pounds an hour. The material is rated at 8100 BTU's per pound so the input on this burner will be a little over 800,000 BTU's an hour.

He went over the permitting requirements of Rhode Island and states he does have experience with the materials that is being burned and assures the Committee that it will not create a nuisance. He stated they are regulated for NOC SOC and CO and particular NOC SOCS and CO

are calculated through a formula provided by the government. He gave the Committee a copy of the emissions criteria.

Mr. Carey concluded his presentation.

Chairman Gregory asked if the Fire Chief has reviewed this application. Steven Kruppa, Monarch Industries answered yes and that the Zoning Board required him to submit the plan to the Fire Chief. The Chief did approve the plan. Chairman Gregory asks that he have it ready for the next meeting.

Chairman Gregory asks what kind of temperatures we are talking about. Mr. Carey states that what you will see on the control panel will be about 1600 to 1800 degrees. He asks if Mr. Carey's company is installing the whole project such as the silo, auger. Mr. Carey said his company is supplying the equipment of the silo, the unloading system, auger, fire extinguisher equipment and burner. It will be set up so that the firebox temperature will be set up with a high fire/low fire situation if the building does not need heat.

Chairman Gregory thanked Mr. Carey.

Ms. Boyle asked if the noise generated will be minimal? Mr. Carey stated yes. The materials will be blown into the silo within a closed looped system. When you close the loop it will have less noise. If the auger system starts making any squeaking noise it means there is a problem and needs to be fixed. He gave the committee a copy of the sound test.

Mr. Gregory states the to his knowledge there have been no complaints from the neighborhood. Mr. Gregory asks Ms. Boyle if she feels we could deem this application complete? Ms. Boyle states yes and that that the application must be submitted with 3 sets of mailing labels for distribution to the abutters within a 200 foot radius, and that once she receives the labels and issues a COC there is a 45 day schedule. The fee has already been submitted. Mr. Gregory asks that this application be put on the September 19 Agenda of the Waterfront Commission to take action.

Chairman Gregory thanked the presenters from Monarch Industries.

2. Public Hearing – Tockwotton Home Application

Chairman Gregory noted that this is a public hearing for Tockwotton and after the presentation the public is invited to ask questions or submit questions.

Richard Sherman, Attorney for the applicant states that he has five witnesses to present testimony. They are Kevin McKay, Jan Greenwood, Diane Dooley, Laura Ernst and Robert Moitoso. He introduced all of the exhibits and asked that they all be part of the Committee's official record.

At this time Attorney Sherman calls his first witness, Mr. Kevin McKay, Tockwotton Home, 75 East Street, Providence RI 02903. He asked Mr. McKay to explain his position at Tockwotton Home. He states he is the Executive Director and has worked there 5 years. He states he has worked in health care for 21 years in management and leadership positions and described his

degrees. He described the history of Tockwotton Home and its services. Tockwotton Home provides assisted living services to 24 residents and provides an affordable assisted living program that is subsidized by Tockwotton Home. Also, we provide skilled nursing care to 42 residents.

Mr. McKay explained that the purpose of the Tockwotton Home in the Bold Point Area is a replacement facility for their building in Providence. Attorney Sherman showed the Board Exhibit 1 which is the Site Plan of the building. Mr. McKay explained that the 10 acre site will be subdivided into a six acre and four acre site. The Tockwotton Home will go on the northern portion. The four acres that will be subdivided on the northern portion of the site will be sold to another entity or person. The hope is that they will develop some type of commercial or business use on that four acres. Tockwotton Home will not be the developer of that site. Those people will be coming before the Commission for that development. The remaining 1.5 acres on the waterfront will be developed by Tockwotton for a public park which will be donated to the City of East Providence. There will be covenants in the agreement so that it cannot be developed for commercial or residential purposes.

Mr. McKay said the design of the building will be five stories. He said there will be 13 single rooms in each wing of the building. The central area of the building will house the support services for the skilled nursing wing. The front of the building on the waterfront site between the two wings will be the dining and living room space. It will have a covered porch in the front.

Mr. McKay said they have been working with the City and Narragansett Electric about moving some of the power lines. Narragansett Electric will bury the power lines from Manchester Street Station all the way across the Providence Waterfront. They spoke with Narragansett Electric and Tockwotton will be contributing a 10,000 square foot piece of property where they will locate their new transmission station. He showed them the Phillipsdale tap line and said that as part of Narragansett's proposal they will move that tap line to the back edge of the Tockwotton property. The power line will be on the Tockwotton property and it will not have any impact on the Braga Social Club.

Mr. McKay said the only new road to be constructed will be the Waterfront Drive and RI Department of Transportation will begin the construction by the end of 2005/ beginning of 2006.

Mr. McKay gave the Committee the hours of operation for staff and visitors, trash pickup etc. They will all be staggered so traffic will not be an issue. There will be a separate entrance way for trash pick up which is done at 6:00 a.m., 3 days a week. The majority of the nursing staff (about 25) comes in between 6:30 a.m. and 7:00 a.m. The hours and

Affordable Housing

Under the ordinance, Mr. McKay states that Tockwotton has affordable assisted living today at their Providence facility and there are five residents in that program. We are proposing seven residents or 10 percent of the assisted living in the new facility at Bold Point. Our hope is to expand that program once we stabilize the operations.

Fiscal Impact Study

Mr. McKay reported that the study indicated the municipal expenses to the City of East Providence would be in the neighborhood of \$63,236 dollars. Tockwotton is a non-profit facility that is exempt from federal and state taxes, but our Board will agree to a payment agreement in lieu of taxes to the City of East Providence. We have discussed this with City Manager Fazioli and will work with the East Providence Senior Center in running an educational program which would help them generate an additional \$30,000 in revenue. He also states they will contribute \$50,000 towards the curbing of the Waterfront Drive and have been working with CRMC in regard to the revetment work needed along the shoreline of the park area. Tockwotton will contribute about \$20,000 towards the design and the permitting of that work. Mr. McKay states that we are working with the RI Department of Health and will need to get a Certificate of Need. We will be filing for that with the Department of Health on January 10 and hope to have that approval by July, 2006.

Building Construction

Mr. McKay states that construction will take place around 2007 once the power lines are relocated per Narragansett Electric.

Chairman Gregory asks if there are any questions from the Committee.

There were none.

Janice Greenwood, Civil Engineer, ESS Group testified before the DRC. She is the Senior Project Manager and described her professional qualifications, licenses, and work experience. Ms. Greenwood states she is currently working on six residential development projects; two of which are under construction in Tiverton, RI. Also she is working on the Johnson and Wales Student Housing project in Providence that will house 576 units. It is similar to the Tockwotton project.

For the record, Attorney Sherman asked that all the Exhibits be entered into the record.

Utility Plan Layout, Drawing C-7

Ms. Greenwood described the proposed utility layout for the project at this time. She said they are proposing all the utility layouts and coordination with the City of East Providence Department of Public Works. Ms. Greenwood said are proposing to relocate the sewer line that runs through the site over land which is interceptor that goes to the Watchemocket Cove Pump Station by gravity. That will be relocated adjacent to the Waterfront Drive and tying in back in to the southern portion of our property where there is a manhole. She states they are working with the City of East Providence to determine which is the best way to obtain water on the site which may mean reactivating the Tangent Street line. The electricity will come from a pole line that runs along Pier Road. The gas for the site will be extended from Mauran Avenue. We are working with the Department of Public Works and the City to see what future requirements will be needed.

Exhibit 4

Grading and Drainage Plan

Ms. Greenwood described the ground floor elevation of the proposed building in relationship to the flood plain and in relation to the Waterfront Drive when constructed. She said the 100 year

flood on this side is elevation 17. The property rises sharply towards Veterans Memorial Parkway. To meet National Flood Insurance Program standards the elevation of the first floor of the building has to be equal to or greater than the base flood elevation of 17. We have established the first floor of the new building will be at elevation 17.2 to meet the requirement. We increased the grade from Waterfront Drive to the main entrance of the building to make it handicapped accessible in a gradual manner. There will be a drive-through entrance that will be handicap accessible.

Ms. Greenwood described the discharge of storm water generated at the site. After the storm water is treated it discharges to the Seekonk River. The roof runoff from the building is piped underground to two infiltration fields within the parking lots; one to the north and one to the south of the building.

To meet the National Fire Protection Code, she reported that to the north of the proposed building is a travel-way that will be 20 feet wide to meet these codes. It is available for emergency access for fire apparatus to get to the back of the building.

Chairman Gregory asked if there is enough access for the fire trucks to make that turn. Ms. Boyle states that the Fire Chief has reviewed these plans, they are in compliance, and will provide the Fire Chief's comments at the September 19 Waterfront Commission meeting.

Mr. Gregory asks how they propose to get the stormwater across Waterfront Drive. Ms. Greenway said they met with DOT and the engineers and DOT will be installing those pipes which will be located underneath Waterfront Drive on the north and south.

Mr. Gregory states that he received comments from the Director Boyle regarding sewer, water drainage and the Waterfront Drive utilities. He distributed them to the members for review and will include them in the review at their next meeting. A copy will also be given the applicant so that they can be prepared for the meeting on September 12.

At this time Diane Dooley, Architect for the applicant testified and explained her professional qualifications and work experience. Ms. Dooley was accepted as an expert witness in architecture. She explained that the building is 5 stories high and will have a front porch and a sloped roof. We will be using traditional residential forms and materials that would be consistent with the location of seaside resort. She describe the techniques that they will be using to break the size of the building in façade such as the changes in materials, surfaces and different coloring that break the scale both in a horizontal direction and a vertical direction which would make the building appear smaller.

Ms. Dooley explained the different entrances of the site and the parking areas. There will be an accessible sidewalk path that will bring pedestrian traffic up to the entry. The larger parking lot will be mostly for staff, but also residents' families will also be allowed to park in the rear of the building as well. Any deliveries will be shielded from the front of the building at Waterfront Drive. The trash bin locations are inside the building with garage doors that would cover them.

Ms. Dooley said that the concept master plan was developed at the request of the Director Jeanne Boyle who was interested in understanding what the potential development of the entire site might be based on the zoning and waterfront guidelines. The drawing illustrates the site built at as a business use. It contains a three story building, parking garages at street level because that

level is below the 100 year flood plain which is un-occupiable. The upper two levels would be business use. A parking garage is located below the building.

Regarding fire safety of the building, Ms. Dooley noted that they have had discussions and meetings with the East Providence Fire Marshall and the building will be constructed of non-combustible materials and will have a full sprinkler system. Fire access is off of Waterfront Drive and has access to both the north and south sides of the site. Ladder service will be through the back of the building.

Ms. Dooley described the materials and colors that are proposed for the construction exterior of the building. The materials chosen are consistent with a seaside look residential resort. The shingles will be of a noncombustible material which will look like wood and will have the look of being weathered. The trim will be white and the building will be a light gray with additional darker gray areas.

At this time Mr. Sherman shows the Committee a board containing certain stones entitled cultured stone. Ms. Dooley described the stone product as being a synthetic type cultured stone which consists of cast stone pieces that are varied in size, textures and colors which have been used on other projects of this type.

At this time, Ms. Dooley described the signage of the building. The main signage will be located on the retaining wall which is on the Waterfront Drive side of the ramp way that leads to the entrance. The signage will be inset as cut-out letters and will contain a logo. It will be illuminated from the bottom side and the cut-out letters will be of a metal material with a background of light stone. There will be plantings at the bottom and in front of that sign. There will be two additional directional signs made of wood into the parking areas. They will be lighted from the ground on each side of the sign.

Ms. Dooley described the planting and vegetation plan. There will be a buffer of trees on either side of the parking areas. The trees will be Maple and there will be plantings at the front of the building of perennial shrubbery and low lying vines at the corners. In the back and side areas there will be seed and loam, and the courtyard will have a garden

Regarding the lighting Ms. Dooley explained that there will be single or double pole lighting within the parking lot areas and street lighting which will be consistent with the Waterfront regulations. The building will be illuminated with down lighting and will not be illuminated dramatically from the exterior. The lighting on the side of the building will make the white trim of the building glow. The interior lighting of the building will be reflecting off surfaces which will glow through the glass at the entryway.

Mr. Pesce asked if there is a second level below the parking area that is contiguous with the parking below the buildings. Ms. Dooley answered that as a test site to maximize the development potential, the driving factor on the northern part of the site is parking and the number of square feet per parking space. The intent is to have as much parking provided as possible. In order to get the amount of building that you see here it would be necessary to build a parking garage that would extend beyond the footprint of the building.

Mr. Gregory asks how much parking will be on the south side of the building. Ms. Dooley answers there will be 67 parking spaces. A total of 85 parking spaces on the total parcel. Mr.

Gregory asks to get a copy of the parking layout plan and courtyard access plan approval by the Fire Marshall for the meeting on September 12.

Ms. Boyle reported that she spoke with Fire Chief Brassill who informed her that it was acceptable to provide access to the rear of the building going via the lobby and is within the regulations of the National Fire Protection. He wants to have additional input as to the actual access to the rear of the building and the grassed area that is going to be reinforced for fire truck access. She states she has that memo from the Fire Chief to that effect.

Mr. Gregory asked about the elevator. They reported there will be an elevator in the building. Regarding the lighting, Mr. Gregory suggested that the full Commission note in the conditional approval process that Tockwotton is willing to conform with the lighting standards of the Waterfront Commission.

Ms. Boyle said that where there is street frontage the applicant is going to be responsible for the installation of the decorative street lighting. Though Waterfront Drive is not constructed yet, the Commission will need to make it explicit in the approval whether the applicant will be responsible for the lighting when it is constructed.

Attorney Sherman introduced Laura Ernst, Project Manager for Licensing and Permitting for the ESS Group Inc., She described her professional qualifications, education, and work experience. She gave information about the proposed revetment and its location to control any coastal erosion. It will extend from the base of the transmission tower per the RIDOT and CRMC permits for the construction of Waterfront Drive. The revetment is about 50 feet from the edge of Waterfront Drive. She described in detail the improvements that Tockwotton proposes to make to the riverfront parcel which is the park. There will be park benches, landscaped vegetation. 25 feet inland will be a vegetated buffer and there will be an area that will be seeded with a meadow mix.

Ms. Ernst described the line of site from the building from the different locations on the bike path and Veterans Parkway and the Bay. She said only parts of the bay view will be obscured, but the buildings will be spaced such that you will be able to see through those buildings.

Ms. Ernst said the permits that will be needed are the RICRMC Assent for the development, a RICRMC Assent for the Revetment, a RIDEM Water Quality Certification, a RIDEM Pollutant and Discharge System construction permit, and also an Army Corps of Engineers permit for the revetment. These permits are all in progress at this time.

Robert Moitoso, Fuss and O'Neill, 275 Promenade Street, Providence, RI testified. He states he is a project manager there and is a registered engineer in Rhode Island and Massachusetts. He described his education, professional qualifications, and work experience. He has experience in roadway and transportation projects since 1987.

Mr. Moitoso states that Fuss and O'Neill prepared a traffic impact statement for Tockwotton Home. Mr. Sherman referenced the Traffic Impact Statement which is part of the application. The conclusion that was reached is that the traffic for both the proposed Tockwotton development and the potential development of the northern portion of the parcel can be safely accommodated on both the existing and proposed roadways in the vicinity of the site. He took into account the traffic that would be generated by the northern portion of the site for commercial purposes, staff,

visitors, employees and deliveries to the site. Mr. Sherman said that they concluded that traffic from the Tockwotton site and immediate area would be safely accommodated at present and in the future.

Tockwotton's presentation concluded. Chairman Gregory thanked them on a fine presentation.

Ms. Boyle informed the DRC that there has been a peer review from Gordon Archibald and Associates (GRA) and it was submitted to the members of the Commission. Ms. Boyle states that the basic conclusion of the peer review from GRA was that they agreed with the conclusions of the applicant's engineer.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Chairman Gregory invited the public to speak at this time or gave them the option to submit their questions in writing to the Committee before the September 19th.

Wesley Plante of East Providence asked what the architect's scale dimensions were. They said the graphic scale is 3/4" = 1' - 0". Mr. Plante was also showed all the major stairwells were in the building. It was noted that there are stairwells at each of the wings of the building and a stairwell in the middle of the building. Mr. Plante asked about an evacuation plan in case of an emergency. Mr. McKay reported at the current time there is no current evacuation plan for this new building.

Mr. Plante asked about the planting plan and what kinds of shrubbery they were using. They described the different plants and told him that the plans were available for review in the Planning Department if he would like to review them.

Mr. Sherman asked that the record reflect that the planting plan will be submitted with the construction drawings at the time the building permit is requested. The planting plan for the courtyard will come back to the Commission for future review

Mazen Alsabe of the RI Department of Transportation asked if Waterfront Drive would be maintained by the State or is it City-owned. If you have access from the Veterans Memorial Parkway then there are more permits that are required from RIDOT. Ms. Boyle answered that once Waterfront Drive is completed, it will be turned over to the City. Mr. McKay states that when Waterfront Drive is completed the title to that will be conveyed to the City so that any access to the project from Waterfront Drive will be from a City street. The only requirements that we would have with curb cuts and access would be those granted by the City's Department of Public Works. Ms. Boyle states that based on the visual analysis there is no impact on Veterans Memorial Parkway which is a designated scenic roadway.

There were no further questions.

Ms. Boyle reminded the public also that a large-scale plan is available for public review within the Department of Planning.

In summary, Chairman Gregory thanked Tockwotton for their generous donation of land to the City within the Bold Point Area. He said this is a valuable addition to the East Providence waterfront. The power lines that will be placed underground will be a tremendous improvement

to the waterfront. There will be federal funding coming in for this and the applicant as well as the City and State have done a tremendous amount of work as well as our Congressional Representatives for this project. The staggered amount of traffic does not appear to have any impact on the area. The applicant is meeting the requirements of affordable giving seven units. They have come forward in a time when tax revenues are very much needed by the. Although the applicant is tax free, they are going to negotiate with the City Manager a payment in lieu taxes which is a very generous donation to the community. Mr. Gregory also said he was impressed that Tockwotton was willing to work with the East Providence Senior Center.

Mr. Gregory said that the DRC is required to give two recommendations; one to the full Waterfront Commission, and one to the Hearing Panel. Because this petition has a non-conforming use, they are required to go before the Hearing Panel public hearing which will be held on September 6th at 6:30 p.m., Room A.

Chairman Gregory thanked the applicant for their professional presentation and thanked the Board for their attendance tonight.

The meeting adjourned at 9:00 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Jeanne M. Boyle
Interim Executive Director

JMB/sac