

**Historic District Commission Meeting
Tuesday, June 28, 2011
Town Hall Meeting Room, Old Town Road.
7:00 pm**

Present: Members: Chair William Penn, Martha Ball, Douglas Gilpin, Dennis Riordan, and Michael Ballard. Members absent: Mark Vaillancourt and Claire McQueeny. Terri Chmiel was present for the recording of the minutes.

Call to Order

Mr. Penn called the meeting to order at 7:00pm.

Leone; Papa. Plat 6, Lot 89. Act on the Subcommittee’s report regarding the appeal of Steve Papa and Aldo Leone.

Business owners Steven Papa and Aldo Leone and architect Herman Hassinger were present. Mr. Penn recapped the travel of the application. The pergola and awning components had been denied by the Historic District Commission; the denial was appealed to the Zoning Board of Appeals (ZBA); the ZBA had remanded it to the HDC; a subcommittee of the HDC had been appointed and submitted their report to the full HDC. Mr. Penn explained that the purpose of the meeting was to review those findings and draft a decision to be submitted to the ZBA referencing the report of the subcommittee and the outline proved by State law the Commission agreed upon the following:

Mr. Riordan made a motion of the Historic District Commission Sub-committee endorsement of the decision. Mr. Ballard seconded the motion.

- | | |
|--------------------------------------|--------|
| 3Ayes (Ball, Riordan and Ballard) | 0 Nays |
| 2 Abstain (Penn and Gilpin) | |
| 2 Absent (McQueeny and Vaillancourt) | |

DECISION:

The NSHDC has reviewed the application of Steven Papa and Aldo Leone for proposed additions to the building generally known as “Aldo’s” located on Weldon’s Way, Block Island, Plat 6, Lot 89.

Following review of all plans and revisions presented and the testimony offered the Commission found the application for Aldo’s did not meet the standards for an issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness and deemed the proposed activity would be incongruous with those aspects of the structure, appurtenances and district which the commission has determined to be historically and architecturally significant.

The Commission gave consideration to the following criteria as set forth in RIGL 45-24.1-4 and Application Procedures of the HDC

The historic and architectural significance of the structure and its appurtenances

The building is located in the Historic District created by the Town of New Shoreham in 1982; is in the Old Harbor Historic District added to the State and National Registers of Historic places in 1972.

It was used as a Fire Barn and Meeting and Assembly Hall into the latter part of the twentieth century; it was up to that time the home of the Block Island Volunteer Fire Department established in 1925.

The way in which the structure and its appurtenances contribute to the historical and architectural significance of the district

The existing Structure is a large, prominent building located in the heart of the Historic District and the Old Harbor commercial district, any new construction or alterations to buildings in the district become part of its fabric and impact the entire district;

The appropriateness of the general design, arrangement, texture, material, and siting proposed in the plans

In terms of compatibility and continuity most of the eating establishment patio seating in the Old Harbor (Old Harbor View Take Out, Rebecca's, most recently HDC approved McPhails) area is shaded with an umbrella system.

The proposal for the fixed pergola, sunshade and awning system presented would diminish the texture of the building by completely covering all remaining open area, diminishing, not respecting and preserving, the existing structure.

The overall impact of the general design, arrangement, texture and materials does not meet guideline definitions of awning or pergolas; it represents excessive massing as reference on Page 9 (A) Form & Massing of Structure in the Historic District Commission, Procedures and Standards Guidebook, not an awning detail as defined on Page 38 Appendix B: Definitions in the Historic District Commission, Procedures and Standards Guidebook and is not appropriate or congruous.

Additionally, the proposal is for a structure located on an already congested street and the siting of the addition of the pergola, sunshade, and awning system would result in a massing which would not contribute to the district.

The applicant has not demonstrated that the proposal is appropriate to this site in particular nor to the New Shoreham Historic District in general.

Therefore the HDC moves denial of the application of Aldo Leone & Steven Papa for additions of a pergola, sunshade and awning systems to the former Fireman's Hall, generally known's as "Aldo's" located on Plat 6, Lot 89 in the Town of New Shoreham for the reasons set forth above.

Mr. Ballard made a motion to accept the recommendation of the Historic District Commission Sub-committee draft decision as drafted subject to review of Legal Counsel and submit to the Zoning Board. Mr. Riordan seconded the motion.

4 Ayes (Penn, Ball, Riordan and Ballard) 1 Nays (Gilpin)
2 Absent (McQueeny and Vaillancourt)

The meeting was adjourned at 8:00p.m. in a motion by Mr. Gilpin and seconded by Mr. Ballard and voted unanimously.

5 Ayes (Penn, Ball, Gilpin, Riordan, Ballard,) 0 Nays
2 Absent (McQueeny, Vaillancourt)

Respectfully submitted,
Terri L. Chmiel
Administrative Assistant
Building & Land Use Department
Approved: